

Abdylnaser Sinani, PhD¹

UDC:
343.352:614.2

**PARALELIZMI NË SHËNDETËSI, KORRUPSION DHE CILËSINË
E SHËRBIMEVE MJEKËSORE NË REPUBLIKËN E
MAQEDONISË:**

Rasti i klinikës së Tetovës

**ПАРАЛЕЛИЗАМ ВО ЗДРАВСТВОТО, КОРУПЦИЈАТА И
КВАЛИТЕТОТ НА МЕДИЦИНСКИТЕ УСЛУГИ ВО
РЕПУБЛИКА МАКЕДОНИЈА**

Случајот на клиниката во Тетово

**PARALLELISM IN HEALTHCARE, CORRUPTION AND
QUALITY OF MEDICAL SERVICES IN THE REPUBLIC OF
MACEDONIA:**

Case of Tetovo Hospital

Abstract

In the Republic of Macedonia, informal politics and power operate in a parallel form alongside the government, which has power of influence in all political, economic and social dimensions. So here is made for the kind words organized state corruption, link to informal structures with state-based system under the services redistributed to them. Subject of this essay is healthcare and quality of healthcare services in the Republic of Macedonia, in the context of corruption, where quality of healthcare services for citizens through the operation

¹ University of Tetova, Faculty of Philosophy, Department of Sociology
(naserinani@yahoo.com)

of parallelism in the healthcare services are almost legal. In this essay was given primary significance of three important segments in field of healthcare. The first segment is the impact on healthcare policy, with the help of which is facilitated the parallelism in healthcare and absorption of these funds from legal sources. The second has to do with the protection of different criminal groups, most often resulting from nepotism in politics. While the third segment shows the rapid drop in the standard of services in the healthcare services of the citizens of Macedonia, as a result of the impact of the first two segments. Tetovo Hospital is a great example of the operation of such corruption, health mafia with masks and under the shadow of parallelism in healthcare services and is a good model for addressing these problems of healthcare issues in the Republic of Macedonia. Through a combined methodical approach, this essay will research the healthcare and causality of parallelism of its negative impact on the medical service value in Macedonia.

Keywords: *parallelism in healthcare, healthcare mafia, quality of healthcare services, corruption.*

Introduction

The object of this essay is healthcare and the quality of health service in Macedonia – the case of Tetovo Hospital. Tetovo Hospital is a striking example of the functioning of corruption, healthcare mafia under the mask and under the shadow of healthcare parallelism and is a good model for dealing with the problem of healthcare in the Republic of Macedonia. For Macedonia and among the findings are that the healthcare system is under intensive reform process in the recent years. All measures taken by the Ministry of Health is that the patients receive services at a lower financial cost as possible, qualitative and fast service. The human rights of the patient, although in theory are essential to the country's social system, they are constantly at the center of all actions taken for reforming the healthcare system, which essentially aims the rebuilding of professional and moral healthcare recovery. Comprehensive approach is focused on the patient who is at the center of government policies. But what's the real state of healthcare in Macedonia? What about Tetovo, other rural settlements? All indicators

say that the situation is alarming: a high degree of corruption, often long waits for surgery, bribe the surgeon, anesthesiologist, physician on duty, medicines, up to the cleaning personnel and the porter: all of them want their share, lack of quality service (dirt, lack of medicines, especially qualitative ones, diagnostic delays all the way to incorrect diagnoses, maintenance of patient rehabilitation rooms) and healthcare parallelism. Healthcare parallelism at all levels. Healthcare parallelism in terms of ties, clientelism, nepotism among public and private healthcare. A limited number of private hospitals (at all levels) has the privilege to cover primary healthcare services outside primary healthcare by the State Healthcare Fund. Tetovo Clinical Hospital has new equipment that rarely are functional. This is of osteoporosis, mammography and magnetic resonance imaging apparatus (Telegraph News Agency). Patients are forced to make appointments in Skopje Clinical Centre, where you should wait a few months, or go to private hospitals to undergo checkups at prices several times higher. Healthcare parallelism in terms of dual employment. This enigma of already disclosed healthcare parallelism in Tetovo is reflected by dual jobs of doctors: full-time employee in a public hospital, but he or his relatives own a clinic, often illegal. The scheme is developed to the extreme: the public hospital appliance is out of order, "it broke down two days ago. Come to my clinic, this service is much better and much quicker. Or the medicines here are not as good, go get them at the X pharmacy (privately of course)".

1. DESCRIPTION OF THE SITUATION

Corruption in healthcare appears individually, it is endemic (related to the profession, as something normal), political and structural corruption (Gorjanski D., 2010). At the Tetovo public hospital prevails the individual and structural corruption, attended by endemic political and corruption. No matter how much we remain silent on corruption in the healthcare sector, corruption is a fundamental factor for evaluating the work of doctors. Corruption affects healthcare policy, the minister, dispense of public funds, creating negative goals in health, even to the perception of health. Corruption that has reached a certain degree in healthcare, subdues all healthcare structures and levels, and instead of working for the benefit of citizens, it begins working for organized crime. In healthcare it means abuse of power in public institutions with

the aim of achieving personal benefit. The World Bank defines corruption as the abuse of public services for the purpose of personal enrichment, and divides it into four groups: bribery, theft, bureaucratic and political corruption up to the misuse of data for the purpose of personal gain (World Health Organization. Key components of a well functioning healthcare system.

www.int/healthsystems/publications/hss_key/en/index.html).

Corruption in healthcare is special because healthcare corruption steals from sick and helpless people, this form of corruption in addition to material damage has also a moral weight. In EU the level of corruption in healthcare is estimated at 5.6%, in Macedonia about 30%. Macedonian public healthcare generally is emptied of all professional, ethical and values content. Whenever the opportunity of profit is presents in healthcare, there emerge three evils: corruption, unprofessional and unnecessary expenses and lack of moral responsibility. About 57% of respondents at the state level believe that healthcare is corrupted. Every third interviewed Tetovo citizen confirms that he had a corruption experience in hospital.

2. FINDINGS: CORRUPT AND UNPROFESSIONAL HEALTH

Search results on healthcare parallelism and problems as a result of the work (not good) in Tetovo hospital, according to the indicators chosen from the researched specimen can be listed as follows: politically influenced governance, corruption/bribery, Conflict of interest: the public-private mixture, unnecessary healthcare costs, waiting lists, lack of law and low morale of doctors and other medical personnel. Many Tetovo public hospital units do not meet the basic working conditions, and there are also clinics which still operate in the so-called destroyed plywood barracks, most of them do not have toilets and hot water. (<http://www.ina-online.net/wp-content/uploads/2016/08>). Healthcare services in Macedonia, including Tetovo clinical hospital, are very far from what we all desire, beginning with infrastructure of hospital facilities, the quality of medicines, medical staff, but apparently the topic of this discourse here is the relation patient - physician, known as the professional medical ethics. The main gangrene remains corruption in health care, where doctors and other medical personnel are lured by the money of patients who in order to get a cure

wait and wander for hours behind the doors of doctors' clinics. Today anyone who is employed in hospitals feels "strong" beginning with guard, sanitation personnel, nurse and the doctor. The only ones who suffer are the citizens, who are forced to give money, to buy a little bit better service. It must be admitted that in this society of crisis, erosion of values, infringement of tradition, respect, those who break the code of ethics most often are people in white uniforms.

A sociological aspect of medical ethics is the treatment, communication and doctor's behavior with the patient. It is not only the issue of bribery, but sometimes more important is how we behave, how we treat our patients, communicate with them, and even more important in this correlation patient-doctors is how we convey and carry the message to the patient or his relative, the way how the doctor will communicate the diagnose to the patient takes a very important place. Unfortunately, our behavioral issues are paid little or no attention at all, in some way we all have felt these behaviors or communication with the doctor. Over 90% of patients surveyed in Tetovo hospital are not satisfied with the doctor's behavior. And this state of inequality and inferiority or subordination of patients in relation to the doctor sometimes hurts more than the disease itself.

3. OUTCOME

In essence, in the health system in the past ten years in Macedonia, Tetovo Hospital is no exception, it is not as different as it was earlier. Even according to research results and other indicators, it is noticed a declining of quality of healthcare service and increased patient dissatisfaction. Private healthcare is strengthened instead of the public one, everyone is declaratively engaged for public healthcare but without strong financial support there could be no qualitative public healthcare. In Macedonian healthcare rules the health monopoly, there is no trace of competing healthcare funds, it is assumed that funds will enhance the quality of competing but also will lower the prices of healthcare services. Patients themselves will decide in which fund will pay healthcare insurance contributions, depending on their financial capabilities, while funds will sign agreements with hospitals. Bribery and corruption are a "normal" part of healthcare in Tetovo hospital, the schemes vary. Doctors do not respect the schedule or the appointments accordingly.

For example, in the orthopedic ward of Tetovo hospital, or in any other ward, a patient who has a checkup appointment at 9.30 o'clock, the doctor comes at ten o'clock and in a routine of 30 minutes he checks all those patients, even those who have an appointment at o'clock 12.30. To some patients he changes their therapy and sends others at the gypsum room, without any prior analysis or laboratory result. A relatively large number of women cannot exercise their legal right to gynecologist, in the absence of gynecologists. In the last ten years the public healthcare is systematically destroyed throughout the Republic of Macedonia, while in Tetovo this disaster is much higher. This process has been deliberate and with serious consequences for patients but in the interest of physicians and pharmaceutical lobby groups. Patients find their way as they can, the easiest way is private hospital or private clinics, but services are expensive, the next opportunity is bribe for operation appointment, checkup or appointment for necessary tests.

CONCLUSIONS

At the Tetovo Hospital bribe for operation (diagnostics of diseases with higher risk degree of risk, such as internal disease, cardiovascular, and any other operation) is a normal part and in most cases the doctors without hesitation take their share of remuneration. Doctors complain of low wages, non-payment of custody, patient arrogance, bad working conditions and surprisingly all of them blame the unfair rivalry. Unlike Skopje public hospital where experienced doctors and good experts flee abroad and to private clinics, but this is not a phenomenon in Tetovo. There is a perception of the citizens of Tetovo, especially those who have any bribery or similar experience that bribing the doctors is something very normal. Every third patient of this hospital has had his history of bribery before surgery or any other intervention. There are doctors who are good professionals, ethical and do not take bribe, but their voice is not heard at all. Patients, most of them why bribing the doctors, who are being paid for their work, have declared that they must do it because doctors find thousand reasons to postpone the treatment or the surgery day. The highest number, more than 80 % of the sample of this research are ordinary citizens, work overseas or have a relative working overseas, 65 percent of them live in the village, the majority of them (70%) are Albanians. If we could draw a conclusion on the situation in Macedonian healthcare through the case of

Tetovo public hospital with one sentence, we can say that: the situation is alarming: high level of corruption, lack of service quality, healthcare parallelism, long waits, high degree of distrust of public healthcare, delays in diagnosis, even false diagnoses, nepotism, high political influence. The perception of Tetovo citizens interviewed on the quality of healthcare services and parallelism is brief and significant: corrupted and unprofessional.

Suggestions:

To improve the quality of healthcare in Tetovo Clinical Hospital the following measures should be taken: moral education in order to strengthen the sense of responsibility, professionalism and trust in themselves and others; eliminate long waiting of patients, eliminate practices of the procrastination of patients: clear and non-disoriented diagnostics, misleading publishing by traumatizing the patients with false and inaccurate diagnosis, create laboratories for reliable analysis, in order to be clear and reliable for patients, increase controls and wages; regulation of informality in healthcare: continuing education of medical staff, and the principle of non-profit work, ethics in public healthcare; good wages in public healthcare; fight of corruption; new management of public healthcare, regulation of overtime work of doctors; good working conditions, good interpersonal relationship; enough free time; career advancement opportunities; participation in decision-making; strengthening of legislation; campaign to raise moral responsibility; good wages, the same level as other important professions.

Bibliography:

Gorjanski D. Obnova zdravstva. Osijek: Zaklada slagalica; 2010.
Fukuyama F. Povjerenje – društvene vrline i stvaranje blagostanja. Zagreb: Izvori; 2000.

Ostojić R, Bilas V, Franc S. Stanje i perspektive razvoja europskih zdravstvenih sustava. Zagreb: Notitia; 2012.

Doktori u Makedoniji traže promene u zdravstvenom sektoru ,Biljana Lajmanovska za Southeast European Times , Skopje, 20.11.2012.

Skandaloze: Spitali i Tetovës po rrjep qytetarët (Dokument).
Nga [inaonline](#) - 05/08/2016

Spitali Klinik i Tetovës me aparatura të reja jofunkionale, t
elegrafi/ janar, 2016

Izmene doktorskih plata podelile zdravstveni sektor u
Makedoniji, 11/09/2012

http://www.setimes.com/cocoon/setimes/xhtml/sr_Latn/features/setimes/2012/09/11feature-04

Вовед во етика и основни етички принципи на здравствената
грижа/ Школа за семејна медицина 30-05-2011 год/ www.wma.net

Region saraduje na otkrivanju i lečenju rak dojke, http://www.setimes.com/cocoon/setimes/xhtml/sr_Latn/features/setimes/2012/10/feature-23/23/10/2012

Германија ќе и помага на Македонија во борбата против
корупцијата, <http://dw.de>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4PSm3u-vKX4>

Study on Corruption in the Healthcare Sector/ http://www.ehfcn.org/images/EHFCN/Documents/EHFCN_ECORYS_20131219

[_study_on_corruption_in_the_healthcare_sector_en.pdf](#)

www.int/healthsystems/publications/hss_key/en/index.html).

World Health Organization. Key components of a well
functioning health system.

www.int/healthsystems/publications/hss_key/en/index.html (<http://www.wina-online.net/wp-content/uploads/2016/08>)

Министерство за здравство на Р. Македонија, Здравствена
стратегија на Република Македонија 2020 godina/ Скопје,
февруари 2007.

Здружение на приватните лекари на Република Македонија,
Загрижувачки податоци: 57% од докторите размислуваат да ја
напуштат Македонија/ <http://www.zplrm.mk/?p=1148>

Светска Здравствена организација: Прирачник по медицинска
етика /<https://www.scribd.com/doc/48672869/>